Abstract

Organisations are increasingly reliant on effective information systems (IS) yet little is known about the information and influences that contribute to their selection. Decision makers play an important role in the evaluation, acquisition and implementation of information systems in organisations. Their role during the pre-implementation phase of information systems projects is critical, yet little is known about how and why these decisions are made. This thesis explores the influences on these decisions and reports their effects. The aim of this research is to increase the understanding of what occurs during decision making in the critical pre-implementation phase.

A cross-disciplinary approach has been employed to develop a research framework informed by literature from information systems, innovation and adoption theory, management decision making and organisational decision making. A qualitative research method was used to develop four exploratory case studies. Research was conducted in private and government organisations that had implemented large information systems. An interpretive hermeneutic text-based analysis technique was used in a cross-case analysis in order to build theory and address the research questions.

Fifty-six informational and contextual factors were identified in this research as having effects on information systems pre-implementation decision making. These factors fall into eight broad thematic factor groups: confidence, decision process, opinions, option attributes, organisation, perceptions, politics and vendor attributes. This thesis concludes that there are linkages between decision factors and decision outcomes. It is argued that to achieve positive decision outcomes from information systems pre-implementation decisions, conditions for intra- and inter-organisational alignment must exist. It is also argued that information systems pre-implementation decision outcomes alter intra- and inter-organisational alignment conditions and affect future decisions.
# Table of contents

ABSTRACT ......................................................................................................................... I

TABLE OF CONTENTS ........................................................................................................ II

LIST OF TABLES ................................................................................................................ VI

LIST OF FIGURES .............................................................................................................. VII

DEDICATION ....................................................................................................................... VIII

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ..................................................................................................... IX

DECLARATION ................................................................................................................... XI

STATEMENT OF PRIOR PUBLICATION ........................................................................... XII

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................. 1

1.1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................... 1
1.2 BACKGROUND AND HISTORY ................................................................................ 1
1.3 JUSTIFICATION ......................................................................................................... 4
1.4 RESEARCH PROBLEM .............................................................................................. 5
1.5 METHODOLOGY ....................................................................................................... 7
1.6 THESIS STRUCTURE ............................................................................................... 7
1.7 DEFINITIONS AND ACRONYMS ............................................................................ 9
1.8 CONCLUSION .......................................................................................................... 10

CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW ............................................................................... 12

2.1 INTRODUCTION ....................................................................................................... 12
2.2 ORGANISATIONAL RESEARCH SIGNIFICANCE .................................................. 13
2.2.1 Failure rates ....................................................................................................... 14
2.2.2 Measuring success and failure ........................................................................ 15
2.2.3 Factors affecting failure .................................................................................. 17
2.3 EVALUATION PROCESSES AND PRACTICES ....................................................... 19
2.4 DECISION MAKING ............................................................................................... 21
2.4.1 What are decisions? .......................................................................................... 22
2.4.2 Types of decisions ............................................................................................. 24
2.4.3 Effects on decision making ............................................................................. 28
2.4.4 Organisational decision process models ......................................................... 37
2.4.5 Why are these models limited? ...................................................................... 42
2.4.6 An alternative decision making model ............................................................. 45
2.5 DECISION FACTORS ............................................................................................. 49
2.5.1 Information ....................................................................................................... 49
2.5.2 Contextual factors ............................................................................................ 50
2.5.3 Relationships between factor acknowledgement and decision outcomes ....... 58
2.6 DECISION VERSUS IMPLEMENTATION ............................................................... 61
2.6.1 Pre-implementation decisions ....................................................................... 62
2.6.2 Implementation decisions ............................................................................... 63
2.6.3 Reactive implementation decisions ................................................................. 63
2.6.4 Post-implementation decisions ..................................................................... 64
2.6.5 Decisions that cause failure .......................................................................... 64
2.7 CONCLUSION .......................................................................................................... 68

CHAPTER 3 METHODOLOGY .......................................................................................... 70

3.1 INTRODUCTION ....................................................................................................... 70
3.2 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK .............................................................................. 70
3.3 RESEARCH QUESTIONS ......................................................................................... 70
3.4 RESEARCH DESIGN .............................................................................................. 74
3.5 DESIGN JUSTIFICATION ...................................................................................... 75
3.5.1 Interpretivist approach .................................................................................... 75
CHAPTER 4 ORGANISATION A ................................................................................. 98

4.1 INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................... 98

4.2 OVERVIEW .................................................................................................................. 98

4.2.1 Interviewees .............................................................................................................. 99

4.2.2 Organisational history .......................................................................................... 102

4.3 SPECIFIC PROJECTS .................................................................................................. 106

4.3.1 Business intelligence suite ................................................................................... 106

4.3.2 Infrastructure upgrade ......................................................................................... 109

4.3.3 Decision making processes .................................................................................. 109

4.3.4 Information sources ............................................................................................. 117

4.3.5 Decision justifications .......................................................................................... 118

4.3.6 Decision factors .................................................................................................... 120

4.3.7 Decision outcomes ............................................................................................... 126

4.4 SUMMARY .................................................................................................................. 130

4.4.1 Decision making processes .................................................................................. 131

4.4.2 Information sources ............................................................................................. 133

4.4.3 Decision justifications .......................................................................................... 133

4.4.4 Decision factors .................................................................................................... 134

4.4.5 Decision outcomes ............................................................................................... 134

4.5 CONCLUSION .......................................................................................................... 135

CHAPTER 5 ORGANISATION B ..................................................................................... 137

5.1 INTRODUCTION ...................................................................................................... 137

5.2 OVERVIEW ............................................................................................................... 137

5.2.1 Interviewees ....................................................................................................... 138

5.2.2 Organisational history ......................................................................................... 140

5.3 THE PATIENT MANAGEMENT AND FINANCIAL SYSTEMS PROJECT .................... 142

5.3.1 Decision making process ................................................................................... 144

5.3.2 Information sources ........................................................................................... 148

5.3.3 Decision justifications ....................................................................................... 149

5.3.4 Decision factors .................................................................................................. 151

5.3.5 Decision outcomes ............................................................................................. 154

5.4 SUMMARY ............................................................................................................... 157

5.4.1 Decision making process ................................................................................... 158

5.4.2 Information sources ........................................................................................... 158

5.4.3 Decision justifications ....................................................................................... 159

5.4.4 Decision factors .................................................................................................. 159

5.4.5 Decision outcomes ............................................................................................. 160

5.5 CONCLUSION ...................................................................................................... 160

CHAPTER 6 ORGANISATION C .................................................................................. 161

6.1 INTRODUCTION ...................................................................................................... 161

6.2 OVERVIEW ............................................................................................................. 161

6.2.1 Interviewees ....................................................................................................... 162

6.2.2 Organisational history ......................................................................................... 164
List of tables

Table 1-1 Table of definitions................................................................. 9
Table 2-1 Causes of IS failure............................................................... 18
Table 2-2 Summary of the contextual factors affecting decision making..... 53
Table 2-3 Pre-implementation decisions............................................. 62
Table 2-4 Implementation decisions.................................................. 63
Table 2-5 Reactive implementation decisions..................................... 64
Table 2-6 Post-implementation decisions.......................................... 64
Table 2-7 Decision and failure causal relationships............................ 65
Table 8-1 Organisational attributes.................................................... 251
Table 8-2 Decision attributes............................................................ 252
Table 8-3 Alignment enabler-factor relationships............................... 304
Table 8-4 Alignment inhibitor-factor relationships............................... 304
Table 8-5 Failure cause and decision factor relationships.................... 306
List of figures

Figure 2-1 Basic decision making model................................................................. 22
Figure 2-2 Refined decision making model............................................................ 43
Figure 2-3 Refined contextual decision making model ........................................... 45
Figure 2-4 Contextual decision making model....................................................... 46
Figure 3-1 Research focus ..................................................................................... 71
Figure 4-1 Business intelligence suite ................................................................. 107
Figure 4-2 Summary of factors and outcomes within organisation A ................. 131
Figure 5-1 Summary of factors and outcomes within organisation B ................... 157
Figure 6-1 Summary of factors and outcomes within organisation C ................... 204
Figure 7-1 Summary of factors and outcomes within organisation D ................. 244
Figure 8-1 Contextual decision making model with feedback............................... 299
Dedication

To Garry, Ros and Simon: the most important people in my life.

and

To Pascal, Portia and Tabitha: the feline equivalents!
Acknowledgements

‘In life's school of wars, that which does not kill me, makes me stronger.’

Friedrich Nietzsche

When I began writing these acknowledgements, I thought that the task would be relatively straight forward. It was something I had been really looking forward to as I had day dreamed scripting the narrative in my mind prior to completion. The intent was that once the thesis was submitted and (hopefully) passed, I would commit this wonderful prose to paper!

However, the reality of writing this acknowledgement has been somewhat bitter-sweet. There are many individuals who shaped the way I approached my education, my choice of profession and ultimately fostered the desire to undertake this research. However, it was never my intent to thank all of these people by name; there were simply too many, and I ran the very real risk of offence by omission. However, the very act of writing this reminded me of these individuals – some of whom are in my distant past or are now deceased.

I have been reminded how privileged I have been throughout my life to be surrounded by people who believed that the pursuit of knowledge and asking ‘why’ was important. I have been reminded of all the people who believed in me when I did not necessarily have belief in myself. And I have been reminded of those who have advised, mentored and inspired me. While I approach these memories with fondness, there is also an element of sadness that some of these people will never know how elemental they were in producing this work.
To all the people who contributed to producing this thesis, I say thank you – you know who you are.

An exception to my blanket thanks is an acknowledgement of the role of Professor Paul Hyland. Paul acted as both my principal PhD supervisor and mentor during the process. While challenging me by setting high standards and goals, his confidence and belief in what I set out to do did not falter during the process. More importantly, he gave generously of his time and experience. For all of this, but especially his kindness, I thank him sincerely.

Finally, I acknowledge and thank the interviewees of the four organisations that were used as cases studies in this thesis. If you take the time to read some of the material in chapters four to seven, you will understand the degree of frankness and honesty I encountered. Without this candour, I would have never been able to gain the knowledge I required to develop, support and explain the findings in chapter eight. Thank you to these people, and their organisations.

Kieren Jamieson
Declaration

The work presented in this thesis is, to the best of my knowledge and belief, original and my own work, except as acknowledged in the text. The material has not been presented, either in whole or in part, for a degree at this or any other university.

Kieren Jamieson
Statement of prior publication

Parts of this work have been published, or accepted for publication, in the following papers:


Jamieson, K & Hyland, P (2007), 'The managed services path to IS infrastructure provisioning: Just a different kind of outsourcing?' Proceedings of The 8th International Research Conference on Quality, Innovation and Knowledge Management, New Delhi, India.


